IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

GARY WILLISCH, et al. : CIVIL ACTION

v. : NO.: 09-5276

NATIONWIDE INSURANCE COMPANY

OF AMERICA

DEBORAH KOLESAR, et al. : CIVIL ACTION

v. : NO.: 09-5510

ENCOMPASS INDEMNITY COMPANY

NICOLE MECADON : CIVIL ACTION

v. : NO.: 09-5511

ALLSTATE INDEMNITY COMPANY

RONALD BUCARI, et al. : CIVIL ACTION

v. : NO.: 09-5512

ALLSTATE PROPERTY AND CASUALTY:

INSURANCE COMPANY

ROBERT BESECKER, et al. : CIVIL ACTION

v. : NO.: 09-5513

PEERLESS INDEMNITY INSURANCE

COMPANY

ALBERT BALDONI, et al.	: CIVIL ACTION
v.	: NO.: 09-5514
STATE FARM MUTUAL AUTOMOBII INSURANCE COMPANY	: LE : :
PAMELA LOWE-FENICK, JAMES BOYLE SR., et al.	: : CIVIL ACTION
v.	: NO.: 09-5515
PROGRESSIVE SPECIALTY INSURANCE COMPANY	· : :
ANN WARRICK, et al.	: CIVIL ACTION
v.	: : NO.: 09-6077
ALLSTATE INSURANCE COMPANY	: :
ORI	<u>DER</u>
AND NOW, this day of	, 2010, upon consideration of
Plaintiffs' Motions for Summary Judgme	nt in each of the above-captioned cases,
and Defendants' Joint Response thereto, i	t is hereby ordered that Plaintiffs'
Motions are DENIED.	
	Savage, J.

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

GARY WILLISCH, et al. : CIVIL ACTION

v. : NO.: 09-5276

NATIONWIDE INSURANCE COMPANY OF AMERICA

DEBORAH KOLESAR, et al. : CIVIL ACTION

v. : NO.: 09-5510

ENCOMPASS INDEMNITY COMPANY

NICOLE MECADON : CIVIL ACTION

v. : NO.: 09-5511

ALLSTATE INDEMNITY COMPANY

RONALD BUCARI, et al. : CIVIL ACTION

v. : NO.: 09-5512

ALLSTATE PROPERTY AND CASUALTY:

INSURANCE COMPANY

ROBERT BESECKER, et al. : CIVIL ACTION

v. : NO.: 09-5513

PEERLESS INDEMNITY INSURANCE

COMPANY

ALBERT BALDONI, et al. : CIVIL ACTION

v. : NO.: 09-5514

:

STATE FARM MUTUAL AUTOMOBILE

INSURANCE COMPANY

PAMELA LOWE-FENICK,

JAMES BOYLE SR., et al. : CIVIL ACTION

v. : NO.: 09-5515

:

PROGRESSIVE SPECIALTY :

INSURANCE COMPANY

ANN WARRICK, et al. : CIVIL ACTION

: NO.: 09-6077

•

:

ALLSTATE INSURANCE COMPANY

v.

DEFENDANTS' JOINT RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTIONS FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT

For the reasons set forth in the accompanying Memorandum of Law,

Defendants respectfully request that Plaintiffs' Motions for Summary Judgment in each of the above-captioned cases be denied.

Respectfully submitted,

BY: /s/ Robert N. Feltoon

Robert N. Feltoon, Esquire

PA# 58197

Deborah J. Krabbendam, Esquire

PA# 41856

CONRAD O'BRIEN P.C. 1515 Market Street, 16th Floor

Philadelphia, PA 19102 Tel: (215) 864-9600

Fax: (215) 864-9620

Attorneys for Defendant Progressive **Specialty Insurance Company**

BY: /s/ James T. Moughan

James T. Moughan, Esquire

PA# 33045

BRITT, HANKINS & MOUGHAN

Two Penn Center Plaza, Suite 515

15th Street and JFK Boulevard

Philadelphia, PA 19102 Tel: (215) 569-6936

Fax: (215) 569-3711

Attorney for Defendant State Farm Mutual

Automobile Insurance Company

/s/ Michael R. Nelson BY:

Michael R. Nelson, Esquire

PA# 65679

G. Franklin McKnight IV, Esquire

PA# 85701

NELSON LEVINE de LUCA &

HORST, LLC

518 Township Line Road

Suite 300

Blue Bell, PA 19422

Tel: (215) 358-5100

Fax: (215) 358-5101

Attorneys for Defendant Nationwide

Insurance Company of America

BY: /s/ Mathieu J. Shapiro

Thomas A. Leonard, Esquire PA# 14781

Mathieu J. Shapiro, Esquire PA# 76266

OBERMAYER REBMANN MAXWELL &

HIPPEL LLP

1617 John F. Kennedy Boulevard

19th Floor, One Penn Center

Philadelphia, PA 19103-1895

Tel: (215) 665-3000

Fax: (215) 665-3165

Attorneys for Defendants Allstate Insurance

Company, Allstate Property & Casualty

Insurance Company, Allstate Indemnity

Company, and Encompass Indemnity Company

BY: /s/ William C. Foster

William C. Foster, Esquire

PA#03511

MARSHALL, DENNEHEY, WARNER,

COLEMAN & GOGGIN

1845 Walnut Street

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Tel: (215) 575-4551 Fax: (215) 575-0856

Attorney for Defendant Peerless Indemnity

Insurance Company

Date: July 16, 2010

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a copy of the foregoing Defendants' Joint Response to Plaintiffs' Motions for Summary Judgment was filed electronically, and is available for viewing and downloading from the ECF system pursuant to Local Rule of Civil Procedure 5.1.2(8), on this 16th day of July, 2010. This electronic filing constitutes service on the following counsel:

Ira Neil Richards, Esquire Trujillo, Rodriguez & Richards, LLC 1717 Arch Street Suite 3838 Philadelphia, PA 19103

BY: /s/ Robert N. Feltoon

Robert N. Feltoon, Esquire

PA# 58197

Deborah J. Krabbendam, Esquire

PA# 41856

CONRAD O'BRIEN P.C.

1515 Market Street, 16th Floor

Philadelphia, PA 19102

Tel: (215) 864-9600

Fax: (215) 864-9620

Attorneys for Defendant Progressive Specialty

Insurance Company

BY: /s/ James T. Moughan

James T. Moughan, Esquire

PA# 33045

BRITT, HANKINS & MOUGHAN

Two Penn Center Plaza, Suite 515

15th Street and JFK Boulevard

Philadelphia, PA 19102

Tel: (215) 569-6936

Fax: (215) 569-3711

Attorney for Defendant State Farm Mutual

Automobile Insurance Company

BY: /s/ Michael R. Nelson

Michael R. Nelson, Esquire

PA# 65679

G. Franklin McKnight IV, Esquire

PA# 85701

NELSON LEVINE de LUCA & HORST, LLC

518 Township Line Road

Suite 300

Blue Bell, PA 19422

Tel: (215) 358-5100

Fax: (215) 358-5101

Attorneys for Defendant Nationwide Insurance

Company of America

BY: /s/ Mathieu J. Shapiro

Thomas A. Leonard, Esquire PA# 14781

Mathieu J. Shapiro, Esquire PA# 76266

OBERMAYER REBMANN MAXWELL &

HIPPEL LLP

1617 John F. Kennedy Boulevard

19th Floor, One Penn Center

Philadelphia, PA 19103-1895

Tel: (215) 665-3000

Fax: (215) 665-3165

Attorneys for Defendants Allstate Insurance

Company, Allstate Property & Casualty Insurance

Company, Allstate Indemnity Company, and

Encompass Indemnity Company

BY: /s/ William C. Foster

William C. Foster, Esquire

PA#03511

MARSHALL, DENNEHEY, WARNER,

COLEMAN & GOGGIN

1845 Walnut Street

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Tel: (215) 575-4551

Fax: (215) 575-0856

Attorney for Defendant Peerless Indemnity

Insurance Company

2

Date: July 16, 2010